1	PODHURST ORSECK, P.A.		
2	AARON S. PODHURST, ESQ. One SE 3rd Avenue, Suite 2700		
3	Miami, FL 33131 (305) 358-2800		
4	BRUCE S. ROGOW, P.A. BRUCE S. ROGOW, ESQ.		
5	100 NE 3rd Avenue, Suite 1000 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301		
6	(954) 767-8909		
7	Co-Lead Counsel for Certified Classes of Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. Customers in <i>In Re Checking Account Overdraft Litig.</i> , MDL 2036, No. 1:09-MD-02036-JLK (S.D. Fla.).		
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
9	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION		
10	SHAHRIAR JABBARI and KAYLEE )	Case No. 3:15-cv-02159-VC	
11	HEFFELFINGER, on behalf of themselves and ) all others similarly situated,	Case No. 5.13-cv-02139-vC	
12			
13	Plaintiffs, )	SUPPLEMENT TO OBJECTIONS OF PLAINTIFFS/CLASS REPRESENTATIVES	
14	v. )	AND CERTIFIED CLASSES IN MDL 2036 TO PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF	
15	WELLS FARGO & COMPANY AND WELLS) FARGO BANK, N.A.,	STIPULATION AND AGREEMENT OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND RELEASE	
16	Defendants.	KLLLAGE	
17	)		
18	On May 15, 2017, the undersigned filed	Objections of Plaintiffs/Class Representatives	
19	and Certified Classes in MDL 2036 to Prelimin	ary Approval of Stipulation and Agreement of	
20	Class Action Settlement and Release (D.E. 136), on behalf of plaintiffs/class representatives in		
21	five certified class actions pending against Wells Fargo, N.A. and its affiliate Wachovia Bank,		
22	N.A. in Multidistrict Litigation Proceeding No. 2036, In re Checking Account Overdraft		
23	Litigation ("the Overdraft MDL"). On May 16, 2017, this Court entered an Order Requesting		
24	Further Briefing by the settling parties and expressed its tentative view "that the overdraft		
25			

### Case 3:15-cv-02159-VC Document 142 Filed 05/17/17 Page 2 of 15

1	claims being asserted in MDL No. 2036 should be carved out of the release [in the settlement].		
2	(D.E. 141).		
3	Plaintiffs/class representatives and Class Counsel in the Overdraft MDL file this		
4	supplement to advise the Court of two subsequent developments.		
5	First, this afternoon, Class Counsel filed a Motion to Enjoin Approval of Jabbar		
6	Settlement (if Necessary) in the Overdraft MDL, alerting Judge King to these proceedings and		
7	the objection filed on May 15 (See attached Exhibit A). In that motion, Class Counsel advised		
8	Judge King that Your Honor has already expressed the tentative view that the overdraft claim		
9	being asserted in the Overdraft MDL should be carved out of the release in the settlement, and		
10	that if Wells Fargo agrees to make that change to the proposed settlement in this case, further		
11	proceedings on the motion filed today in the <i>Overdraft MDL</i> may be unnecessary.		
12	Second, last night, after this Court issued its Order Requesting Further Briefing, Well		
13	Fargo's counsel requested that Class Counsel join them for a conference call that was schedule		
14	for 2 pm PST (5 pm EST). A few minutes before the scheduled call, Wells Fargo's counse		
15	Erin Cox, emailed Class Counsel canceling the scheduled call and declining to meet and confe		
16	any further.		
17	Michael Sobol and Roger Heller of Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP wil		
18	appear on behalf of Class Counsel in the Overdraft MDL at the preliminary approval hearing		
19	scheduled for tomorrow morning at 10 a.m., and will be prepared to address the Objection and		
20	related matters.		
21			
22	DATED this 17th day of May 2017.		
23	Respectfully submitted,		
24	<u>/s/ Aaron S. Podhurst</u>		
25	Florida Bar No. 063606 Florida Bar No. 067999		

### Case 3:15-cv-02159-VC Document 142 Filed 05/17/17 Page 3 of 15

1	apodhurst@podhurst.com brogow@rogowlaw.com			
	Robert C. Josefsberg, Esquire BRUCE S. ROGOW, P.A.			
2	Florida Bar No. 40856 100 Northeast 3rd Avenue			
3	<u>rjosefsberg@podhurst.com</u> Peter Prieto, Esquire  Suite 1000 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301			
4	Florida Bar No. 501492   Tel: 954-767-8909   pprieto@podhurst.com   Fax: 954-764-1530			
5	Stephen F. Rosenthal, Esquire Florida Bar No. 0131458			
6	srosenthal@podhurst.com PODHURST ORSECK, P.A.			
7	One SE 3rd Avenue Suite 2700			
8	Miami, FL 33131			
9	Tel: 305-358-2800 Fax: 305-358-2382			
10	Co-Lead Class Counsel in the <i>Overdraft MDL</i>			
11	/s/ Robert C. Gilbert			
12	Robert C. Gilbert, Esquire Florida Bar No. 561861			
	rcg@grossmanroth.com			
13	GROSSMAN ROTH, P.A.			
14	2525 Ponce de Leon Boulevard			
·	Eleventh Floor			
15	Coral Gables, FL 33134 Tel: 305-384-7270			
16	161. 303 301 7270			
17	Coordinating Class Counsel in			
18	the Overdraft MDL			
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

1			
2	/ <u>s/ E. Adam Webb</u> E. Adam Webb, Esquire	<u>/s/ Michael W. Sobol</u> Michael W. Sobol, Esquire	
	Georgia Bar No. 743910	California Bar No. 194857	
3	Adam@WebbLLC.com	msobol@lchb.com	
	Matthew C. Klase, Esquire	Roger N. Heller, Esquire	
4	Georgia Bar No. 141903	California Bar No. 215348	
5	Matt@WebbLLC.com	rheller@lchb.com	
	G. Franklin Lemond, Jr., Esquire	LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &	
6	Georgia Bar No. 141315	BERNSTEIN L.L.P. Embarcadero Center West	
_	FLemond@WebbLLC.com WEBB, KLASE & LEMOND, LLC	275 Battery Street, 30th Floor	
7	1900 The Exchange, S.E.	San Francisco, CA 94111	
8	Suite 480	Tel: 415-956-1000	
	Atlanta, GA 30339	Fax: 415-956-1008	
9	Tel: 770-444-9325		
10	Fax: 770-217-9950		
10			
11	/s/ Russell W. Budd	/s/ David S. Stellings	
	Russell W. Budd, Esquire	David S. Stellings, Esquire	
12	Texas Bar No. 03312400	New York Bar No. 2635282	
13	rbudd@baronbudd.com	dstellings@lchb.com	
13	BARON & BUDD, P.C.	LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &	
14	3102 Oak Lawn Avenue	BERNSTEIN L.L.P.	
	Suite 1100	250 Hudson Street	
15	Dallas, TX 75219	8th Floor	
16	Tel: 214-521-3605	New York, NY 10013	
10	Fax: 214-520-1181	Tel: 212-355-9500 Fax: 212-355-9592	
17	/s/ Ruben Honik	1'ax. 212-333-9392	
	Ruben Honik, Esquire	/s/ Ted E. Trief	
18	Pennsylvania Bar No. 33109	Ted E. Trief, Esquire	
19	rhonik@golombhonik.com	New York Bar No. 1476662	
19	Kenneth J. Grunfeld, Esquire	ttrief@triefandolk.com	
20	Pennsylvania Bar No. 84121	Barbara E. Olk, Esquire	
	kgrunfeld@golombhonik.com	New York Bar No. 1459643	
21	GOLOMB & HONIK, P.C.	bolk@triefandolk.com	
22	1515 Market Street Suite 1100	TRIEF & OLK 150 E. 58th Street	
22	Philadelphia, PA 19102	34th Floor	
23	Tel: 215-985-9177	New York, NY 10155	
	Fax: 215-985-4169	Tel: 212-486-6060	
24		Fax: 212-317-2946	
25			
25	Class Counsel in the <i>Overdraft MDL</i>		

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 1 2 I hereby certify that on May 17, 2017, I presented the foregoing to the Clerk of Court for 3 filing and uploading to the CM/ECF system, which will provide notice upon the counsel of record listed below: 4 5 David H. Fry MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 6 560 Mission Street, 27th Floor San Francisco, CA 94105-2907 7 Erin J. Cox 8 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor 9 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560 10 Counsel for Defendants 11 Derek Loeser Gretchen Freeman Cappio 12 Daniel P. Mensher 13 KELLER ROHRBACK LLP 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200 14 Seattle, WA 98101-3052 15 Jeffrey Lewis KELLER ROHRBACK LLP 16 300 Lakeside Drive, Suite 1000 Oakland, CA 94612 17 Matthew J. Preusch 18 1129 State Street, Suite 8 19 Santa Barbara, CA 93101 20 Counsel for Plaintiffs 21 DATED this 17th day of May 2017. 22 Roger N. Heller /s/ 23 1349582.1 24 25

## Exhibit A

#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 1:09-MD-02036-JLK

IN RE: CHECKING ACCOUNT OVERDRAFT LITIGATION

**MDL No. 2036** 

# THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO: FIRST TRANCHE ACTIONS

Garcia, et al. v. Wachovia Bank, N.A. and Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. S.D. Fla. Case No. 1:08-cv-22463-JLK

Spears-Haymond v. Wachovia Bank, N.A. and Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. S.D. Fla. Case No. 1:09-cv-21680-JLK N.D. Cal. Case No. 08-4610

Dolores Gutierrez v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. S.D. Fla. Case No. 1:09-cv-23685-JLK D. Or. Case No. 3:09-cv-01239-ST

Martinez v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. S.D. Fla. Case No. 1:09-cv-23834 D.N.M. Case No. 6:09-cv-01072-GBW-ACT

Zankich, et al. v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. S.D. Fla. Case No. 1:09-cv-23186-JLK W.D. Wash. Case No. C-08-1476-RSM

#### MOTION TO ENJOIN APPROVAL OF JABBARI SETTLEMENT (IF NECESSARY)

Plaintiffs, the appointed class representatives in these certified class actions pending against Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. and Wachovia Bank, N.A., move, through appointed Class Counsel, for the entry of an Order enjoining Defendants from proceeding with a proposed class

action settlement of a case in the Northern District of California which would potentially release some overlapping claims or damages of the certified classes in this MDL. Class Counsel filed an objection in that case, *Jabbari v. Wells Fargo Co., et al.*, Case No. 3:15-cv-02159-VC (N.D. Cal.), and the Hon. Vince Chhabria has indicated that he is tentatively persuaded by the objection. *See* Exhibits A (the objection) and B (Judge Chhabria's Order).

Nevertheless, we are filing this motion in an abundance of caution, and in furtherance of Class Counsel's duty to protect the rights of the certified classes and this Court's interest in not having a defendant breach this Court's primary jurisdiction over class claims that it has already certified in this MDL. Depending upon the result of the preliminary approval hearing in *Jabbari*, currently scheduled for May 18, 2017, Plaintiffs may need to request a hearing before this Court on this motion for entry of an injunction under the All Writs Act.

#### **BACKGROUND**

On June 8, 2015, this Court entered two orders certifying classes of Wells Fargo and Wachovia bank customers. [**DE** # **4180**, **4181**]. As the Court is quite familiar, those orders followed extensive litigation and numerous appeals over an eight-year period in this MDL.<sup>1</sup>

The *Jabbari* case, in contrast, is still in its relative infancy. The *Jabbari* complaint has absolutely nothing to do with the assessment of overdraft fees or the resequencing of debit transactions, which are the subject matter of the certified class actions in this MDL. It focuses, instead, on the claims of account-holders who were damaged by Wells Fargo's creation of fake

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The procedural history of the cases against Wells Fargo and Wachovia in this MDL includes this Court's Orders denying for the most part the banks' initial motion to dismiss [**DE** # 305], resolving multiple discovery disputes between the parties [**DE** # 691, 907, 909, 1033, 1089], denying the banks' untimely motion to compel arbitration against the named Plaintiffs [**DE** # 3415], granting Plaintiffs' motions for class certification [**DE** # 4180, 4181], and most recently, denying the banks' motions to compel arbitration against the absent class members [**DE** # 4319, 4320]. Those Orders remain on appeal, during the pendency of which this Court has issued a "Blinco" stay. [**DE** # 4325].

bank accounts without their customers' knowledge or consent. The complaint asserts various statutory claims, including claims for violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681 ("FCRA"), consumer fraud, and unjust enrichment against Wells Fargo. It does not mention the term "overdraft fee." Several months into that litigation, Judge Chhabria granted Wells Fargo's motions to compel arbitration and dismissed the operative complaint.

During the pendency of the *Jabbari* plaintiffs' appeal, the parties commenced settlement discussions and reached an agreement in principle. Following the announcement of Wells Fargo settling with several different regulators over the highly publicized fake-accounts scheme, which obligated Wells Fargo to refund certain fees to customers for a period between 2011 and 2015, the bank initially reached a \$110 million class settlement with the *Jabbari* plaintiffs on March 25, 2017. Subsequently, the parties extended the class period back to May 1, 2002, and increased the settlement amount to \$142 million.

Class Counsel in this case learned of the *Jabbari* settlement though news reports of the filing of a motion for preliminary approval on April 20, 2017. A review of the proposed release that Wells Fargo negotiated in the settlement agreement revealed that it is unduly broad and appears to potentially compromise in part the claims or damages of overlapping class members in this MDL. *See* Exhibit C (*Jabbari* release, especially § 1.18 (mentioning "overdraft fees"), § 2.47 (defining "Released Claims"), § 2.48 (defining "Released Parties"), § 2.51 (class definition)).

Upon learning that Judge Chhabria had set a preliminary approval hearing on a short schedule, Class Counsel promptly alerted Wells Fargo's counsel of the potential problem the release posed for the certified classes here. *See* Exhibit D (May 11, 2017 letter). During an ensuing meet-and-confer conference, the bank's *Jabbari* counsel rejected Class Counsel's

requests for either a modification of the release to exclude claims and damages of the certified classes in MDL 2036 or the filing of a written representation before Judge Chhabria (and this Court) that Wells Fargo would never assert that the *Jabbari* release compromised any claims or offset any of its exposure in MDL 2036. As a result, Class Counsel filed an objection to preliminary approval in *Jabbari*. *See* Exhibit A. The motion pointed out that the class periods in that case and this MDL overlap and that the language in the release, "all claims . . . that . . . could have been asserted" in *Jabbari*, could be read to release Wells Fargo from some MDL class members' claims or damages. The motion also pointed out that this problem was compounded by the proposed notice program in *Jabbari*, pursuant to which much of the *Jabbari* class, as defined, would not receive direct notice of that settlement.

After receiving the objection, and several others, Judge Chhabria entered an order which, among other things, expressed his tentative view that the release is overbroad:

The Court is tentatively inclined to reject the phrase "could have been asserted" in the release, as it seems to be unnecessary and may cause confusion. The Court is also tentatively of the view that the overdraft claims being asserted in MDL No. 2036 should be carved out of the release.

Exhibit B, ¶ 8. The court then asked the parties in *Jabbari* to brief whether these tentative views would require the court to reject the proposed settlement. *Id.* Class counsel have scheduled another conference with Wells Fargo's *Jabbari* counsel to address whether Judge Chhabria's order has changed the bank's earlier position.

Class Counsel plan to attend the May 18, 2017 preliminary approval hearing in San Francisco in *Jabbari* and will report back to this Court whether any developments there render the need for the relief requested in this motion moot.

#### **ARGUMENT**

Wells Fargo's actions in *Jabbari* threaten to usurp this Court's authority to adjudicate the long-pending, certified class action claims pending against it and Wachovia here. If Judge Chhabria does not reject the overbroad release language in the *Jabbari* settlement, then this Court should assert the authority entrusted to it by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation ("JPML") to superintend and govern the litigation of the claims arising from the subject matter of this MDL against Wells Fargo and Wachovia.

We do not belabor here the legal authority which empowers this Court to take the requested action. This Court has exercised that authority before in this MDL when another bank threatened to circumvent this Court's primary jurisdiction. *See In re Checking Account Overdraft Litig.*, 859 F. Supp. 2d 1313 (S.D. Fla. 2012) (entering All Writs Act injunction against BancorpSouth, Inc.).

The All Writs Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1651, authorizes district court judges to "issue all writs necessary or appropriate in aid of their respective jurisdictions and agreeable to the usages and principles of law." As shown in *In re Managed Care Litigation*, 236 F. Supp. 2d 1336 (S.D. Fla. 2002), the All Writs Acts was designed for just this type of situation where the proposed release of claims in another judicial district would interfere with the Court's disposition of those same claims. *Cf. Smith v. Bayer Corp.*, 564 U.S. 299, 317 (2011) ("we would expect federal courts to apply principles of comity to each other's class certification decisions when addressing a common dispute"); *In re Bank of Am. Wage & Hour Emp't Litig.*, 740 F. Supp. 2d 1207, 1209 (D. Kan. 2010) (enjoining issuance of class settlement notice in a competing case pending outside that MDL).

Furthermore, the cases in this MDL, Garcia, Spears-Haymond, Gutierrez, Zankich, and Martinez, are the first-filed cases against Wells Fargo pertaining to overdraft fees. Yet the

proposed Jabbari release threatens to potentially encompass some of the claims and damages

asserted by the certified MDL classes. Under the "first-to-file rule," the entire action should

generally be decided by the court in which the action was first filed. See Manuel v. Convergys

Corp., 430 F.3d 1132, 1135-36 (11th Cir. 2005); Smith v. S.E.C., 129 F.3d 256, 361 (6th Cir.

1997); Cadle v. Whataburger of Alice, Inc., 174 F.3d 599, 606 (5th Cir. 1999); Mann Mfg. v.

Hortex, Inc., 439 F.2d 403, 408 (5th Cir. 1971). Given that Wells Fargo is about to use a wholly

unrelated case about the unlawful creation of fake accounts to potentially release certain

overdraft fee claims before this Court, the first-filed doctrine underscores this Court's primacy

over this issue.

**CONCLUSION** 

Neither Class Counsel nor this Court can risk that the proposed *Jabbari* class settlement,

with its current overbroad release, secures court approval. This Court was chosen by the JPML

to preside over these cases almost eight years ago. No Court has more experience or a better

understanding of the issues involved, or how best to adjudicate them. In the event that Judge

Chhabria does not reject the settlement, this Court should act to preclude Wells Fargo's direct

attempt to undermine this Court's authority granted by the JPML.

LOCAL RULE 7.1 CERTIFICATE

Pursuant to Local Rule 7.1, I hereby certify that Class Counsel for the certified classes in

Garcia, Spears-Haymond, Gutierrez, Zankich, and Martinez have conferred with counsel for

Wells Fargo, by letter and telephone on multiple occasions, regarding the issues raised in this

6

motion. Wells Fargo does not consent to the relief sought herein.

Dated: May 17, 2017.

#### Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Aaron S. Podhurst\_

Aaron S. Podhurst, Esquire
Florida Bar No. 063606
apodhurst@podhurst.com
Robert C. Josefsberg, Esquire
Florida Bar No. 40856
rjosefsberg@podhurst.com
Peter Prieto, Esquire
Florida Bar No. 501492
pprieto@podhurst.com
Stephen F. Rosenthal, Esquire
Florida Bar No. 0131458
srosenthal@podhurst.com
PODHURST ORSECK, P.A.
One SE 3rd Avenue
Suite 2700

/s/ Bruce S. Rogow

Bruce S. Rogow, Esquire Florida Bar No. 067999 brogow@rogowlaw.com BRUCE S. ROGOW, P.A. 100 Northeast 3rd Avenue Suite 1000

Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301 Tel: 954-767-8909

Fax: 954-764-1530

Co-Lead Class Counsel

Miami, FL 33131 Tel: 305-358-2800 Fax: 305-358-2382

#### /s/ Robert C. Gilbert

Robert C. Gilbert, Esquire Florida Bar No. 561861 rcg@grossmanroth.com GROSSMAN ROTH, P.A. 2525 Ponce de Leon Boulevard Eleventh Floor Coral Gables, FL 33134 Tel: 305-384-7270

Coordinating Class Counsel

/s/ E. Adam Webb

E. Adam Webb, Esquire

Georgia Bar No. 743910

Adam@WebbLLC.com

Matthew C. Klase, Esquire

Georgia Bar No. 141903

Matt@WebbLLC.com

G. Franklin Lemond, Jr., Esquire

Georgia Bar No. 141315

FLemond@WebbLLC.com

WEBB, KLASE & LEMOND, LLC

1900 The Exchange, S.E.

Suite 480

Atlanta, GA 30339

Tel: 770-444-9325

Fax: 770-217-9950

/s/ Russell W. Budd

Russell W. Budd, Esquire

Texas Bar No. 03312400

rbudd@baronbudd.com

BARON & BUDD, P.C.

3102 Oak Lawn Avenue

Suite 1100

Dallas, TX 75219

Tel: 214-521-3605

Fax: 214-520-1181

#### /s/ Ruben Honik

Ruben Honik, Esquire

Pennsylvania Bar No. 33109

rhonik@golombhonik.com

Kenneth J. Grunfeld, Esquire

Pennsylvania Bar No. 84121

kgrunfeld@golombhonik.com

GOLOMB & HONIK, P.C.

1515 Market Street

**Suite 1100** 

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Tel: 215-985-9177

Fax: 215-985-4169

/s/ Michael W. Sobol

Michael W. Sobol, Esquire

California Bar No. 194857

msobol@lchb.com

Roger N. Heller, Esquire

California Bar No. 215348

rheller@lchb.com

LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &

BERNSTEIN L.L.P.

Embarcadero Center West

275 Battery Street, 30th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111

Tel: 415-956-1000

Fax: 415-956-1008

/s/ David S. Stellings

David S. Stellings, Esquire

New York Bar No. 2635282

dstellings@lchb.com

LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &

BERNSTEIN L.L.P.

250 Hudson Street

8th Floor

New York, NY 10013

Tel: 212-355-9500

Fax: 212-355-9592

/s/ Ted E. Trief

Ted E. Trief, Esquire

New York Bar No. 1476662

ttrief@triefandolk.com

Barbara E. Olk, Esquire

New York Bar No. 1459643

bolk@triefandolk.com

TRIEF & OLK

150 E. 58th Street

34th Floor

New York, NY 10155

Tel: 212-486-6060

Fax: 212-317-2946

Class Counsel

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

CASE No. 09-MD-02036-JLK

IN RE: CHECKING ACCOUNT OVERDRAFT LITIGATION

**MDL No. 2036** 

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 17, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF. I also certify that the foregoing document is being served this day on all counsel of record or *pro se* parties identified on the attached Service List in the manner specified, either via transmission of Notices of Electronic Filing generated by CM/ECF or in some other authorized manner for those counsel or parties who are not authorized to receive electronically Notices of Electronic Filing.

/s/ Stephen F. Rosenthal

Stephen F. Rosenthal, Esquire Florida Bar No. 0131458 srosenthal@podhurst.com PODHURST ORSECK, P.A. One SE 3rd Avenue Suite 2700 Miami, FL 33131

Tel: 305-358-2800 Fax: 305-358-2382